



NDI Quarterly Report SECURITY SECTOR REFORM PROGRAMS

**Global Civil-Military Relations Program
USAID Cooperative Agreement No. AEP-A-00-98-00014-00**

October 1 - December 31, 2001

I. SUMMARY

The past quarter was a productive one for the National Democratic Institute for International Affairs' (NDI's) Security Sector Reform Programs (SSRP). Following the tragic events of September 11, SSRP was forced to postpone two workshops in Indonesia and Nigeria scheduled for October and November, respectively. An improved international security environment since then allowed NDI to go ahead with its scheduled workshops in Peru and Cambodia in early December. These workshops were NDI's first workshops following the successful conference held in Abuja, Nigeria, on June 6-7, 2001. While the workshop in Peru focused on the role of the legislature in providing democratic oversight of state intelligence functions, the workshop in Cambodia focused on current and future trends in civil-military relations. The program received an 18-month extension from the U.S. Agency for International Development (USAID) providing additional funding totaling \$591,241. SSRP had been operating on \$162,800 it received from USAID in July 2001. With remaining funding, SSRP hopes to complete upcoming workshops in Indonesia, Nigeria and East Timor in addition to continuing programming in Peru and Cambodia. Throughout this quarter, SSRP continued to receive numerous requests for information and petitions from local actors for NDI to do work in the field. With the help of NDI's regional teams, the Institute's SSRP staff hope to follow up on these requests and develop new security sector programming opportunities around the world.

II. BACKGROUND

The liberalization and democratization of a military or military-dominated regime do not always lead to the establishment of a stable, consolidated democracy. In many cases, the legacy of military influence in domestic political affairs leaves newly elected leaders without the expertise or institutional mechanisms necessary to assert civilian control of the military. The situation may be further complicated by the military who,

upon viewing the new leaders as incompetent, resist attempts by civilians to assert control. When such a dynamic unfolds, in the best scenario, it slows democratic development; in the worst scenario, it can catalyze attempts by the military to reassert its control over government.

In July 1998, the National Democratic Institute for International Affairs (NDI) entered into a cooperative agreement with the U. S. Agency for International Development (USAID) to create a Partnership for Democratic Governance and Security (PDGS) an information, education and development alliance to promote and support democratic governance through bolstering the capacity of civilian institutions to establish and strengthen their leadership, management, and oversight of their military forces. The partnership was dissolved in July 7, 2001, after three years.

PDGS programs were created and conducted with the cooperation of national legislatures, political parties, civic organizations, academic institutions, the media and the civilian members of the defense establishment belonging to newly emerging democracies. They consisted of four core activities:

- The publication of a series of practical resource documents for defense policymakers in nascent democracies.
- The development of a web-based governance and security clearinghouse that provides a database of laws and constitutional provisions related to defense oversight, policy directives, “white papers,” case studies and civil-military publications that can be easily accessed by policymakers in democratizing states.
- The development of an educational module or collection of lessons learned on how to establish and strengthen civilian capacity in military oversight and defense policymaking through the use of democratic processes and procedures.
- The provision of workshops, consultations and programs dealing with the various aspects of establishing and strengthening a functional system of democratic civilian control of the armed forces. These activities are country-specific or cross-regional requests from government, political parties, civic groups, journalists and universities.

Since the end of PDGS, NDI has continued its programming to enhance civilian oversight of the military. In July 2001, NDI held a workshop on promoting the role of the legislature in enhancing democratic oversight of defense policy and the armed forces in Nigeria. This workshop was the first activity that SSRP has conducted in the post-PDGS era. The positive response received by NDI has led to requests to continue programming in that country. NDI has also undertaken successful workshops in Peru and Cambodia, which will be discussed in further detail below. With PDGS over, NDI continues to pursue in-country security sector reform programs.

III. PROGRAM ACTIVITIES

Civil-Military Relations Seminar in Togo

On October 29-31, Dr. Eva Busza, NDI Senior Program Advisor on Security Sector Reform Programs, participated in the “Seminar on the Promotion of Civil-Military Relations in Africa: A Factor for Peace and Security” organized by the United Nations Regional Center for Peace and Disarmament in Africa (UNREC) in collaboration with the African Union, and with funding from the African Center for Strategic Studies (ACSS) and NDI’s Central and West Africa Regional Team. The purpose of the seminar was to bring together members of the armed forces, civilian policy-makers and NGO representatives from a group of African states to work on producing a code of conduct for African armed forces. This document could then be submitted to the Organization of African States (OAU), which could take the draft principles drafted in Togo and develop them into a formal code which could then be ratified by respective members of the OAU. The conference used as its model a code of conduct developed in Mali in the late 1990s.

The conference was, in NDI’s assessment, only a partial success. It did provide a rare occasion for informal contacts between various sectors of society and the military in a neutral environment. It also gave participants the opportunity to network and to begin to establish cross-regional ties with each other. Similarly, some important and interesting issues were raised in the plenary discussions. For example, there was a general consensus that both the state and civil society should recognize that there are certain roles that the military adopts in Africa which are regionally specific. Participants contended that these roles are compatible with democratic governance. They include: preserving the territorial integrity of the state, assisting other forces of the state in the fight against banditry, quelling civilian unrest, assisting civilian communities during natural disasters or other calamities, and contributing to regional or UN-sponsored peacekeeping or peace monitoring operations. Participants also urged that much greater attention be devoted to defining and discussing the rights and obligations of the different types of armed and security forces. They also suggested that more attention be given to issues regarding the relationship of civil society to various armed groups and forces. A final contribution of the conference was in part a consequence of its location: as the American Ambassador to Togo commented, it was valuable to hold an open debate on military issues in a country like Togo where a high degree of censorship exists.

The main drawback of the conference was that it failed to achieve its prime goal: gaining a widespread consensus on a code of conduct. While, the conference did publish a document—many participants felt that the document was less a reflection of their concerns and discussions and more a document written by a few core members in UNREC. In addition, the conference suffered from UNREC’s inability to provide good management and logistics.

Workshop in Peru

On December 3-5, 2001, NDI held a workshop in Peru on the role of the legislature in providing democratic oversight of the Peruvian security sector. The program was designed for members of the Congressional Defense Committee, as these legislators can play a central role in moving forward an agenda for security sector reform. In addition to the members of the Defense Committee, other civilian officials with expertise related to the topics to be discussed were also invited.

The goals of the workshop included:

- Introducing concepts of civilian control of the security sector as it pertains to the Peruvian context.
- Assessing the current legal structure and identifying changes to the legal system that would facilitate oversight and accountability of the armed forces and intelligence agencies.
- Exposing legislative representatives to specific tools of fiscal and budgetary control and demonstrating how these tools are employed in other countries.
- Facilitating a critical assessment by the members of the Defense Committee of the current state of civil-military affairs in Peru.
- Assessing the problems and challenges that members of Congress identify in their attempts to assert control over the military and assisting them in the development of specific programming that will address these concerns.

The structure of the workshop was developed to address the needs identified by the participants and by a group of international trainers—Juan Rial, Jaime Garretta, and Col. (retired) Spracher—who are extremely familiar with the political situation in Peru. The first day examined the broader context for reform. The trainers explored the legal and judicial framework within which various institutions in the security sector act. They drew upon the reform experiences of other Latin American countries and suggested strategies for reform. A wide range of topics was covered from military education to intelligence reform to military courts.

The second day of the workshop focused on intelligence oversight. The trainers examined the legal and judicial frameworks within which Latin American intelligence agencies operate, and using comparative Latin American reform experiences, extrapolated successful strategies and identified lessons for potential reformers. The trainers examined the role of the Congress, particularly the role of the Defense Committee, in driving intelligence oversight. They described mechanisms for intelligence oversight as it is practiced in other democracies, including: hearings, independent commissions and reporting agencies, fiscal and budgetary oversight, laws on state secret laws, etc. Finally, they examined strategies for taking advantage of the current political environment to institute much needed intelligence reform.

The workshop, held in collaboration with the Congressional Defense Committee generated a significant amount of enthusiasm and was covered favorably in the local press. Workshop participants numbered 35-40 on both days.

The workshop afforded NDI the opportunity to engage the Peruvian Congress in security sector reform. NDI is currently working on developing a follow-on program that would involve working with Congress members, officials from the Armed Forces Restructuring Committee, and the Ministry of Defense on drafting a defense white paper.

Workshop in Cambodia

On December 13-14, 2001, NDI held a joint workshop on civil-military relations in Cambodia with the Cambodian Institute for Cooperation and Peace (CICP) with the support of the U. S. Agency for International Development (USAID). The workshop sought to assess the current state of security sector reform in Cambodia and methods of improving democratic oversight of defense and security affairs. The two-day workshop also addressed Cambodia's Defense White Paper and demobilization, integration and disarmament. Other topics addressed by the workshop included the role of the parliament in defense and security, enhancing better relations between the public and military, and the future of civil-military relations in Cambodia.

More than 700 government and NGO representatives, police and military officials, parliamentarians, diplomats and students attended the conference. Participants strongly recommended mandating national security to the military and internal security to the police. Various methods of redeploying soldiers were discussed. Suggestions included delegating soldiers to build roads and provide medical and other services. They could also participate in peacekeeping missions. The participants also discussed reducing the size of the army and placing more troops in the reserve. On the issue of improving civil-military relations, participants spoke about the need to strengthen the relationship between the public and the military. As the military learns to allow civilian input into its development, civil society will be more willing to retrain ex-soldiers and aid them in job placement.

Several key policy recommendations also emerged from the observations and conclusions made by participants during the two days of discussion. These were:

- Cambodia must adopt a comprehensive program of military reform.
- Civilians must assert their control of the armed forces.
- Civilians must enforce the political neutrality of the armed forces.
- Civilians must clearly define the military's mandate and facilitate the adoption of approved military roles.

- The Ministry of Defense in conjunction with military leaders must promote organizational change within the armed forces.
- Cambodia's demobilization program requires course readjustment.
- Both civilians and soldiers must take steps to build trust and improve communications across the civil-military divide.

This workshop was the first in a series of 10 workshops that will be sponsored by NDI and the Cambodian Institute for Cooperation and Peace (CICP). These workshops will focus on a variety of topics within the field of civil-military relations. Program participants include government and defense officials, civil society members, political party representatives, MPs and academics as well as international experts in civil-relations. Future workshops are discussed below.

IV. EVALUATION

Based upon the success of the Peru and Cambodia workshops, SSRP believes that it is moving in the right direction. A good indicator of the program's success lies in the fact that NDI we will do continued programming in Nigeria, Cambodia and Indonesia. The program was able to increase its visibility both within NDI and externally. External inquiries about the NDI SSRP program confirm an interest in security sector reform.

V. FUTURE ACTIVITIES

SSRP works with NDI's regional teams to design and conduct workshops and other programs worldwide focusing on security sector reform. In this spirit, SSRP intends to hold upcoming workshops in Indonesia, Nigeria, East Timor and Cambodia. SSRP hopes that the success of these workshops will build upon the success of previous workshops and highlight the importance of security sector reform as a key component of democracy building.

Peru

As mentioned above, SSRP has suggested that NDI seek funding to help Peru define its national defense and security interests through the writing of a white paper. NDI believes that civilians are still largely unable to control and manage the Peruvian military. Although the Commission for the Restructuring of the Armed Forces is about to announce a series of legal and constitutional amendments that form a part of their military rebuilding plan, the government has yet to define the nation's national security interest along with detailing upcoming reforms. The production of a defense white paper will outline Peru's vision of defense not only to potential international rivals but to their own public. While the transitional government of Valentin Paniagua encouraged the Defense Ministry under the directorship of Minister Ledesma to draft a white paper, there are few indications that this document received much support from the outside world. In

a concept paper, Dr. Busza highlighted several options that NDI could take in funding the drafting of a white paper.

Cambodia

In the next few quarters, SSRP will also continue to work with the Cambodian Institute for Cooperation and Peace to implement a series of nine workshops. Currently, the following topics are being considered: (1) preventive methods for ensuring that demobilized soldiers do not become bandits; (2) challenges of reintegrating soldiers into society—what can civil society do; (3) land reform and land distribution/conflict resolution tied to soldiers returning to reclaim their land in the villages; (4) national security legislation and frameworks; (5) the role of the Cambodian parliament in defense and security; (6) how should military structures and civilian structures interact; (7) reconciliation and building up trust between soldiers and citizens; (8) the role of civil society in providing civilian oversight of the armed forces; and (9) the role of the media in CMR.

East Timor

This quarter NDI secured funding from USAID's Office of Transition Initiatives (OTI) in East Timor for a new program on civil military relations. The program, which will begin next quarter, focuses on expanding citizen knowledge on the role of the armed forces in a democratic society, helping civil society and political parties establish channels of communication between governing officials and the armed forces, and assisting civil society and the media to develop a capacity to monitor the decisions and policies adopted by the executive and the legislature and to oversee armed forces personnel behavior.

The Institute will convene a working group of interested East Timorese civil society groups, academics, senior media editors, constituent assembly members, political party members, and East Timorese Defense Force (FDTL) members to meet regularly to discuss and debate issues surrounding security sector reform in a series of five seminars over six months. International and domestic experts will lead the working group sessions. They will provide technical advice frequently in the form of lessons learned from other comparative international experiences and will create an opportunity for participants to solve problems and develop action plans for policy development and implementation. Throughout the working sessions, NDI would encourage participants to explore how civilians could develop advocacy and watchdog functions.

NDI will also organize a series of community-level dialogues with existing community-based organizations to expand civilian knowledge of basic democratic practices in the security sector. In these discussions, participants will formulate their own views on how East Timor should develop its security and defense policy. NDI will also suggest ways in which society could have a voice in policy-making and will explore with participants ideas on how communities can work to promote democratic stability, transparency and accountability in the security sector.

Case Studies

Finally, SSRP hopes to publish some case studies on military and voting, coups, and intelligence laws. These papers will serve as useful resources for security sector reform programs. An additional paper on terrorism and democracy is also being considered.

For further information on NDI's work in Security Sector reform, please contact:

Dr. Eva Busza
Senior Program Advisor
National Democratic Institute of International Affairs
Security Sector Reform Programs
2030 M Street NW, Fifth Floor
Washington, DC 20036-3306

Tel (202) 728-5500
Fax (202) 728-5520
e-mail: ebusza@ndi.org
<http://www.ndi.org>